

Summary:

Mid-term Review of the Tanzania Road Sector Programme

The agreement on the Tanzania Road Sector Programme states that an independent programme review will be carried out half way through the programme. The review shall assess the achievements compared to the programme objectives, assess sustainability and provide recommendations for a possible continuation of the support.

NORAD entered into a contract with the Institute of Transport Economics – Norwegian Centre for Transport Research (TØI) for the purpose of the Mid-term Review. The main input to the review was collected during a mission to Tanzania January/February 2000. The results of the review are summarised below.

The Current Road Sector Programme

The agreement on the current TAN 045 - Road Sector Programme (RSP) was signed in February 1998. The programme is focused on institutional strengthening and co-operation and gives less emphasis to physical maintenance and rehabilitation than the previous road sector programme. The purpose of the current programme is to increase the competence and efficiency in road administration in Tanzania.

TAN 045 consists of 10 components: Management and Organisational Development, Financial Management System, Maintenance Management, Road Safety and Axle Load Control, Bridge Management, Central Material Laboratory, Equipment Management, Appropriate Technology Advisory and Training Project, Miscellaneous Support, and finally, Program Administration.

Programme Efficiency and Sustainability

As described in Chapter 5 of the report, the result or the effectiveness of the programme is acceptable, considering the fact that only half the programme period has expired. One of eight technical components has achieved full effectiveness, four components have started to take effect and three components have yet to show effect.

Table 5.3 in Chapter 5 of the report shows the anticipated percentage used by end June 2000 of the budgeted NORAD funds. In Table 1 below, we have related this percentage to the results achieved so far by the various components.

Table 1 Anticipated Percentage used by end June 2000 (NORAD funds) relative to the Results achieved by Component.

Component	Per cent used	Result
1 Management and Organisational Development	75	None
2 Financial Management System	0	None
3 Maintenance Management	5	None
4 Road Safety and Axle Load Control	89	Some
5 Bridge Management	73	Some
6 Central Materials Laboratory	91	Some
7 Equipment Management	79	Full
8 Appropriate Technology Project	92	Some
9 Miscellaneous Support	0	-
10 Programme Administration	64	-
Total	67	

The accordance between the anticipated percentage of budget spent and the results of the components is quite good, except for Component 1. The high percentage of budget used for Component 1 is the cost of the technical adviser, whose efforts have not been assessed in this review. There is no standard to determine whether the amounts spent are reasonable for this kind of programme. It is, consequently, quite difficult to say whether the results of this programme are reasonable compared to the resources spent. However, by the mid-term of a programme, it is reasonable to find that at least 50 per cent of the resources are spent, whereas the full results for the programme can only be expected to appear at the completion of the programme period.

Sustainability cannot be considered achieved as yet for the overall programme, but several components are moving towards sustainability. This situation is acceptable at mid-term of the programme, if serious efforts to create sustainability are made in the remaining two years period.

Experience with Institutional Co-operation

The institutional co-operation between MoW and NPRA, which applies for most programme components, has been useful in building up the capacity of the ministry in road management, road safety and axle load control, bridge management, the Central Materials Laboratory, and equipment management. It has also greatly facilitated project supervision through the Technical Forum and annual meetings.

The relationship between the advisers and MoW staff has been amicable and beneficial to both parties. MoW staff have found it easier to deal with NPRA, than in dealing with a consultant, because they relate to only one institution and more of less the same individuals. This ensures better continuity for the project.

The success of a programme component has depended on how closely the adviser has followed up the project. For some components, e.g., Road Safety, a single annual visit by each adviser may not be sufficient to push for faster results.

The institutional co-operation between MoW and ILO is much more limited as it only concerns one component, the Appropriate Technology Advisory and Training Project. Generally, however, co-operation between the two parties appears to have been satisfactory.

In view of the above observations, it is recommended that the institutional co-operation between MoW and NPRA continue with minor modifications. Future institutional co-operation should be closely examined in relation to the establishment of the new road agency, TanRoads.

Reporting and Administrative Routines

The work plans and related budgets for the Road Sector Programme are very well described and are basically following the same set up for all the components. Component co-ordinators seem to have a good overview of the activity carried out on their component.

Registering of disbursements are thoroughly carried out and the reported figures seem correct and all the relevant documents are filed and accessible. The procedures for disbursements seem secure. The rate of disbursements has improved considerably for TAN 045 as compared to the previous programme.

The reporting also seems to have caught up and is now more or less in accordance with the requirements stated in the agreement. The reporting is extensive. All the information required is reported. The reports should be shortened and focus on the relevant information. This would hence make them much more accessible.

For the remaining period of TAN 045, we recommend to continue the existing financial management procedures with some minor changes for registering and reporting. As a consequence the budget on Component 2 for developing a financial management system, can be re-allocated to other purposes. A small amount should, however, be set aside to allow for limited support if required for streamlining the set up of the reports.

A New Basis for continued Institutional Support

The establishing of the new road agency TanRoads, now scheduled for July 2000, is a major step towards a more efficient organisation of road management in Tanzania. It is well in line with international and SADC recommendations for road sector reform, and fairly advanced compared to what is being implemented in other countries in the SADC-region. TanRoads will not only provide a much better basis for development of the road sector, but also a much more solid platform for donor support in future. When TanRoads becomes operational in the second half of this year, it will be a good first step in the road sector reform process and all parties, including donors, should have an interest in its success. Activities related to improvements of road sector management, including both development and maintenance of roads as well as administrative routines, should consequently be supported as much as possible during the remaining period and beyond. These would e.g. be activities such as management training for TanRoads staff and development of a proper maintenance management system for TanRoads. Efforts

should be made to have the Maintenance Management system fully implemented as outlined in the Programme Document of April 1997 within the TAN 045 programme period.

Against the above background, there are strong reasons for further support to the road sector as soon as possible. Others, in particular the European Union (EU) and Switzerland has already pledged to continue and increase their support to development of the sector. The EU will initially finance the services of a consultant who will work jointly with the TanRoads Core Team during the transition period up to June 2000. The consultant is expected to provide expertise that may be lacking in the Core and to design a programme of institutional support to the Road Fund Board, TanRoads, Local Government and the new Ministry of Works. This programme is expected to provide the basis for donor funding for continued institutional support and also to provide guidance for setting priorities for the final stages of the TAN 045 Road Sector Programme.

Completion of the Current Programme

A major part of the work carried out in the first two-year period of the current programme has been necessary preparations for improvement of basic conditions in the road sector, such as preparing technical manuals, setting up an accident recording system and introducing an axle load control programme. The second part of the Road Sector Programme should, therefore, emphasise institutional support to the implementation and the use of what has been prepared in the first period in order to see effects and impacts of the resources spent, see Chapter 8 of the report for details. Some of this implementation can be carried out within the remaining two years programme period. Other parts will, however, require longer time to be implemented and will thus have to be continued beyond the time perspective and possibly also the budget of the current programme, see below.

The current budget includes an unallocated amount of NOK 3.35 million. In addition to that, NOK 2.0 million allocated to Component 2 can be used for other purposes. Further, it seems that the amount budgeted to Miscellaneous Support can be reduced at this late stage of the programme, say from NOK 0.4 million to NOK 0.25 million. Against this background, about NOK 5.5 million will be available for allocation to other components. Such reallocation should be seen in the light of the priorities within the various components as outlined in Chapter 8 of the report and the need for institutional support to TanRoads as being identified during the transition period.

Continuation beyond the Current Programme

It appears that there will be a need for continued institutional support beyond the time perspective of the current programme. Identification of areas for possible continued support cannot be done in detail in a meaningful way at this stage. It will depend on a number of unknown factors, among them the priorities for completion of the current programme and the contents of the EU funded programme of institutional support to the sector. There are, however, some areas where it seems

likely that there will be a need for continued institutional support. They are outlined in Chapter 8.

It is anticipated that beyond the current programme, there will also be continuous need for institutional support to the sector within management and organisational development and maintenance management. This could become a focal point for continued Norwegian support.

Main Conclusions

The institutional reform process in the road sector in Tanzania has come a long way. The TanRoads scheduled for operation by July 2000, will provide a strong new platform for the remaining programme activities and is likely to improve the chances of a successful termination of the current Road Sector Programme (RSP). All parties, including donors, would have an interest in its success, and there are good reasons for further institutional support to the road sector as soon as TanRoads becomes operational. Several functions included in the RSP, such as the road workshops, the Central Materials Laboratory (CML) and to some extent road safety, need to find their proper and partly new roles within the new organisational structure for road sector.

Programme running well – mostly preparatory Work so far

The programme is generally running well, and considerable achievements have been made in several programme components. As can be expected, a major share of the activities during the first half of the programme period has been of a preparatory character. Consequently, considerable effects of the programme remain to be seen. Extensive effects and impacts cannot be expected at the mid-term of the programme.

Progress and Achievements varies between Components

There is great variation between the eight technical components as to progress and achievements. Most successful in meeting the objectives so far, is Component 7 Equipment Management, which is considered having a clear impact on the management and financial sustainability of the regional workshops. Component 4 Road Safety and Axle Load Control, Component 5 Bridge Management, Component 6 Central Materials Laboratory Management and Component 8 Appropriate Technology Project have started to take effect. Component 1 Management and Organisational Development, Component 2 Financial Management System and Component 3 Maintenance have made only marginal or no progress so far.

Too wide Range of Activities

Several components such as Road Safety and Axle Load Control have started a wide range of activities. A clearer priority between activities and emphasis on activities likely to produce significant effects also in a shorter time perspective would have improved the results.

Relevance, Effectiveness and Sustainability

The overall objectives of the programme as well as the component objectives are considered relevant to the general road and road traffic situation in Tanzania.

Only one technical component can be considered having achieved full effectiveness while four have started to take effect. This result should be acceptable as only half the programme period has been completed.

For the overall programme, sustainability cannot be considered achieved as yet, but several components are moving towards sustainability. Such a situation, is considered acceptable at this stage if serious efforts to create sustainability are made in the remaining programme period.

Financial Progress

By December 1999 approximately 50 per cent of the NORAD funds were spent. By June 1999 approximately 30 per cent of the GoT funds were spent. Adding another half year to the GoT funds, to make it comparable to the NORAD funds, an estimated 40 per cent of the GoT funds would be spent by December 1999. This means that the financial progress of the GoT funds is somewhat slower than that of the NORAD funds.

The current NORAD budget allows for approximately NOK 5.5 million to be allocated or reallocated for other components than indicated in the initial budget.

Institutional Co-operation

The institutional co-operation between MoW and NPRA has been useful in building up the capacity of the ministry. MoW staff have found it easier to deal with NPRA, than in dealing with a consultant, because they relate to only one institution and more of less the same individuals. This ensures better continuity for the project. The relationship between the advisers and MoW staff has been amicable and beneficial to both parties.

Reporting and Administrative Routines

The reporting and the rate of disbursements have improved considerably for the current programme (TAN 045) as compared to the previous (TAN 080). Still, some 3 months pass from the time the invoice is issued until payment is received, and there is consequently room for further improvement. The reporting is now more or less in accordance with the requirements stated in the agreement. The reports should, however, be shortened and more focussed, and some routines need fine-tuning.

Further Needs for Institutional Support

A number of activities are considered needing further support, some in the current programme and some beyond the programme. Implementation of those activities prepared in the first part of the programme is needed in the remaining programme period. TanRoads is expected to provide shortly, through a technical advisory project funded by the EU, a framework for continued support to the sector at all levels.

Main Recommendations

Continue, emphasising Implementation and supporting TanRoads

The programme should be continued in order to obtain the expected effects of the various preparations made in the first part. Emphasis should be put on implementation of these activities and supporting TanRoads in road sector management. In the latter respect, management and organisational development including training of staff and improvements of maintenance management systems appear particularly relevant at this stage.

Concentrate efforts to fewer Activities within each Component

Within each component, priorities should be made for activities expected to have high effects. Efforts should be concentrated on these activities.

Maintenance Management must be emphasised

Efforts should be made to have the maintenance management system fully implemented within TanRoads during the second half programme period.

Amending the Road Traffic Act and Approval of Programme

The proposed amendments to the Road Traffic Act should be given high priority. Efforts should be made to secure that the Road Safety Programme and the Axle Load Control Programme are approved as soon as possible to stimulate effective road safety activities and axle load control.

Demonstrate Effects of Road Safety Measures

Effective road safety measures such as traffic engineering and enforcement combined with information campaigns should be implemented as pilot projects. The results of these projects should be communicated effectively to the public at large and to decision-makers.

Strategies for Road Workshops, CML and Road Safety

Realistic institutional and organisational options for the road workshops, the Central Materials Laboratory (CML) and to some extent road safety should be identified. Business strategies for the road workshops and the CML, which can be developed within the Management and Organisational Development Component, should be defined as soon as possible.

Implementation of TAN-BRIDGEMAN

Comprehensive training on the new bridge management system and computerisation of the remaining regions should be emphasised in the remaining programme period. Preparation of Bridge Management Codes of Practice should be made in the period.

Increase Use of Labour-based Technology

The future success of labour-based technology depends on its actual use in road maintenance and construction. Effort should be made, in the remaining programme period, to ensure that this technology is given more room in projects funded by the Road Fund in order to reach the targeted 30 per cent of annual budgets.

More frequent Visits and more Communication between Visits

To stimulate the implementation of programme activities more frequent visits by the NPRA technical advisers should be considered and frequent communication between visits should be carried out.

Simplify Reporting and Administrative Routines

The present reporting and administrative routines should be continued and some minor modifications and simplifications should be introduced for the remaining programme period. Invoices should be registered and follow-up routines should be introduced to simplify reporting and ensure that invoices are paid in time.